



M. NARIKBAYEV
KAZGUU
UNIVERSITY

KAZGUU LIBERAL ARTS DIGEST

VOLUME 04
DECEMBER 2022



INFORMATION ABOUT THE JOURNAL

“KLAD” is a student journal first published at M. Narikbayev Kazguu University School of liberal arts. This journal is aimed at enhancing students’ involvement into science and research.

«KLAD” journal admits for publication various types of articles: original research, review articles, short reports or essays, reflections, case studies, methodologies and cases in english; containing the results of fundamental and applied research in the field of philosophy and identity, history of kazakhstan, pedagogy, linguistics and methods of teaching languages, translation, and tourism.

CONTENTS

Проблемы с социализацией подростка в школе и как это влияет на его индивидуализацию	7
Ашкенова К., Жумагазина М., Насанова Ж.	
Жас дағдарысы кезіндегі бастауыш сынып оқушысының жеке басының дамуының жағымсыз факторларының психологиялық диагностикасы	17
Бағайқызы А., Шаку Ұ., Асаналі М., Жабенова Т., Максұтова Ж.	
Психология личности и гендерная специфика. Как гендер влияет на становление личности?	27
Бахромова А., Изтелеуова К., Ким И	
Влияние типа родительского воспитания на адаптацию ребенка в социуме	34
Бекенова А., Берғалиева А., Жанкина Д., Жумадилова А., Константи́ниди А.	
Sociolects used in M. S. Narikbayev KAZGUU University	49
Akizhanova M.	
Phraseological Units of the English Language Containing Proper Names	54
Gulnaz E. Baltabolat	
Peculiarities of Political Discourse in the English Language	61
Lunara Barysheva	
Use of Compounds in Scientific Texts	69
Yelizaveta Frolova	

Word Order in English and Chinese: A Case Study of the Chinese Folk Tale	76
Assemgul Khamidullova	
Representation of the Trilingual policy by Kazakhstani Media and Information Portals	86
Russalina Akhmerova	
Competitive Environment	98
Barysheva Lunara, Frolova Yelizaveta, Serikbay Dilyara	
Bilingualism from early childhood	104
Baigazy Zhamilya	
What Are the Challenges of International Students in the Adaptation in Another Country?	116
Indira Kabdrasheva	
Experiences of the NIS Graduates with the CLIL Approach	128
Kalymzhanova Azhar	
Experiences of the Individuals with Multilingual Upbringing in Kazakhstan	140
Tokzhan Yessengali	
Language Learning Motivation	148
Tomiris A. Zhilkibayeva	
Experiences of students with disabilities at KAZGUU University	167
Abylgazina Aidana, Askhatova Meerim, Erik Aigerim	
Young women should get married according to civil law but not to traditions	175
Akkuzinova Leila	
Young women should get married according to civil law but not to traditions	178
Leila Akkuzhanova	
Young women should get married according to civil law but not to traditions	181
Anelya Ayapbergenova	
Young women should get married according to civil law but not to traditions	184
Anuarbek Shugyla	

Young women should get married according to civil law but not to traditions	187
Kazi Venera	
Each president should be elected only once	191
Koltsov Konstantin	
Young women should get married according to civil law but not to traditions	194
Kuandykova Aibibi	
Ladies in Eastern countries must cover their bodies	197
Orazbayeva Aruzhan	
The Day of the Dead	201
Kurdykenova K.	
PARIS FASHION WEEK	203
Sagadiyeva Yerkezhan	
Saint Patrick's Day in Ireland.	205
Danish Aisulu	
Members of Editorial Board	207



PART 02

KAZGUU LIBERAL ARTS DIGEST

RESEARCH
PAPERS



EXPERIENCES OF THE NIS GRADUATES WITH THE CLIL APPROACH

KALYMZHANOVA AZHAR

INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND

In accordance with the trilingual education policy, piloting schools in Kazakhstan are implementing a Content and Language Integrated Learning approach. This method became a core of the trilingual education model in Nazarbayev Intellectual schools in Kazakhstan (AEO NIS, 2013, as cited in Karabassova, 2020). NIS is organizing CLIL in line with international standards. Through the implementation of the CLIL methodology, students learn simultaneously both the language and school subjects.

According to Syzdykbayeva (2017), the experiences of piloting schools will be transferred to general education schools in Kazakhstan. Therefore, to effectively implement the method in mainstream schools, there is a paramount objective of conducting the various studies that will provide an overview of the situation regarding the level of application of CLIL in piloting schools. Since CLIL in NIS as a core of trilingual education shapes the language abilities of the students (AEO NIS, 2013, as cited in Bekenova, 2016), it is necessary to understand the extent to which this method meets all the stated criteria based on the opinions of students.

THE PROBLEM

Piloting schools such as NIS and Kazakh-Turkish lyceums were implementing a

trilingual education model long before the governmental decision to start introducing trilingual education on a broader scale. Studies showed that teachers encounter various challenges related to foreign language proficiency and teaching during CLIL classes (Huertas-Abril & Shashken, 2021; Kakenov, 2017; Karabassova, 2020). Such issues that arise in implementing the CLIL approach require a thorough investigation of all the stakeholders. According to Syzdykbayeva (2017), there is a lack of research, exploring the perception of the students on CLIL, who are considered as main stakeholders, in the Kazakhstani context. Moreover, the long-term effects and benefits of CLIL after graduation are not studied. Although the research investigating the CLIL application in Kazakhstan based on the opinions of teachers and students is replenishing, more research on CLIL would enhance the understanding of this phenomenon and contribute to program improvement.

STATEMENT OF PURPOSE AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This study aims to examine the experiences and the perception of the NIS graduates on the CLIL approach. The research will reveal the long-term influence of education based on the implementation of the CLIL method.

1. How do graduates of NIS schools describe their experiences of studying subjects with the implementation of the CLIL approach?

2. What sort of challenges did the graduates of NIS encounter in the CLIL lessons?
3. How does their experience with the CLIL help them after graduation?

RESEARCH DESIGN/APPROACH OVERVIEW

Since the research seeks to identify the perception of the NIS graduates on their experience with CLIL during school and after graduation, a qualitative research design best suits the study. Semi-structured face-to-face and online interviews will help to formulate the answers to research questions. The NIS graduates will choose the format of the interview based on their preferences.

RATIONALE AND SIGNIFICANCE

This study will shed light on the understanding of CLIL and its impact on students. Studying the NIS graduates' opinions about this method, as well as understanding what challenges they encountered and why, and how CLIL helps them at university will not only contribute to improving the implementation of CLIL but will also help to revise and develop a trilingual education program. Identifying the possible benefits and challenges of the CLIL method will broaden the existing literature on CLIL in the Kazakhstani context. This research attempts to address the research gap regarding the long-run influence of CLIL. With the understanding of the effects of the CLIL approach on students before and after their graduation, educational institutions can make efforts to improve the methodology of the content and language teaching as well as stimulate the development of academic and personal skills.

DEFINITIONS OF KEY TERMS

Throughout this study, CLIL is used as an abbreviation for Content and Language

Integrated Learning. Coyle et al. (2010) define the term CLIL as a 'dual-focused educational approach in which an additional language is used for the learning and teaching of both content and language' (p. 1). A foreign language of a learner, regional or a second language (L2) relates to an additional language.

OUTLINE

The research paper includes 6 chapters. The context, problem, purpose, and significance of the study are presented in the introduction. The second chapter Literature Review presents the existing theoretical knowledge on CLIL and analysis of relevant sources regarding this topic in international and Kazakhstani contexts. In the Methodology chapter, the research design, sample, data collection, and analysis are provided. Furthermore, this chapter includes important aspects of the research such as the limitations of the study, ethical considerations, and the researcher's reflection. The Findings chapter reports the results of the data collected through interviews. The Discussion section analyzes and interprets significant findings and links them to the reviewed literature. The Conclusion chapter summarizes the results of the research, suggests implications and recommendations for the improvement of CLIL implementation and further studies, and finally, points out the limitations.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) is a learning method that is extensively implemented throughout the globe, especially in countries with bilingual and multilingual education. Much of the current literature on the Content and Language Integrated Learning pays particular attention to the effectiveness of the program around the world through the perception of teachers and students. In the context of Kazakhstan, while there has been much research on the opinion of teachers regarding the implementation of

CLIL, there is a lack of research that takes into consideration the impact of CLIL on students in the long term.

CLIL IN THE INTERNATIONAL CONTEXT

CLIL has been actively used around the globe for a long time, especially in Europe to promote bilingualism and trilingualism. According to Eurydice (2006), the Canadian experiment with immersion teaching of the French language in the province of Quebec in the 1970s influenced the development of the CLIL methodology. Then this method began to develop and spread throughout Europe in the 1990s. In 1995, the European Council adopted a resolution according to which students of the European Union Member States 'should have the opportunity of learning two languages of the Union other than their mother tongue(s) for a minimum of two consecutive years during compulsory schooling' (Council of the European Union, 1995, p. 4). It is worth noting that since then, in each country, the method of introduction and application of the CLIL was different, as each country has its educational peculiarities. Many researchers have noted that the widespread implementation of CLIL in European school systems has contributed to educational changes in foreign language learning (Goris et al., 2019; Lorenzo et al., 2010; San Isidro, 2018). Moreover, similar alterations have occurred in other parts of the world such as Asia and Australia, and South America. Notwithstanding an active application of the CLIL approach, there is a discrepancy in studies on the effectiveness of CLIL. Many studies found that CLIL positively affects foreign language proficiency and increases the interest of the students (Pladevall-Ballester, 2018; Fielding & Harbon, 2020; Huertas-Abril & Shashken, 2021; Zaroni, 2021), while Finardi et al. (2016) revealed that students in Brazil encounter with the difficulties in understanding the technical vocabulary, as well as problems for teachers on the practical level. In fact, there are certain challenges in effectively

teaching both the subject and language in every country where CLIL is applied. According to a systematic review by Goris et al. (2019), CLIL performs best in the education system of Spain in terms of providing a better English as a Foreign Language (EFL) learning approach, while in the Netherlands, Germany, and Austria EFL proficiency did not indicate significant results on tests. Hence, CLIL functions differently in schools of various contexts.

CLIL IN THE CONTEXT OF KAZAKHSTAN

Kazakhstan supports tripartite language unity due to its historical background, as well as the political, economic, and social opportunities that Russian and English languages provide. Nazarbayev (2012) stated that the trilingual language policy should be encouraged by the state. In light of the decision to implement trilingual education, some researchers have begun to examine the attitudes of the Kazakh population toward multilingual education. According to Zhilbayev et. al. (2019), the majority of teachers, students, and parents demonstrated a positive attitude toward teaching natural-mathematical cycle subjects in the English language. Moldagazinova (2019) argues that the standard of living in the country will increase with the use of trilingual education according to many participants' views, despite the opposition of some of the Russian-speaking and Kazakh-speaking population to studying subjects in Kazakh and Russian, respectively. Further research is needed to determine the long-term impact of trilingual education.

Kazakhstan launched a project of CLIL method implementation within trilingual education policy. This approach is implemented in piloting schools such as Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools (NIS) and Bilim Innovation Lyceums. Moreover, other secondary schools applied CLIL as an experimental method for a short period. The number of studies that have

focused on the perception of teachers on CLIL prevails over those that investigated the opinion of the students. According to Bekenova (2016), teachers expressed positive opinions and attitudes towards the CLIL method, mentioning the beneficial influence of the approach on improving language proficiency. Unlike Bekenova, Kakenov (2017) argues that the CLIL teachers of NIS who teach History, and Geography in Kazakh were confronted with a lack of students' language proficiency and educational materials. Based on both Bekenova and Kakenov's research, the great distinction between the teachers of the CLIL can be revealed. CLIL teachers who teach in English have more positive attitudes toward the methodology because they have access to greater facilities for teaching than those teachers who teach CLIL classes in Kazakh and Russian. For a more detailed study of this phenomenon, the opinions of the students are needed. Among studies of students' attitudes towards the CLIL methodology, few studies have been found. Syzdykbayeva (2017) investigated the opinions of secondary school students. In her major study, the benefits and limitations of the CLIL approach were identified; she also reported that students negatively perceive CLIL because of insufficient language support and teachers' lack of experience. Certainly, CLIL corresponds to the policy of multilingualism in Kazakhstan, although it requires further exploration of the stability of the students' perception and whether they benefit after graduation.

A review of the existing literature aimed to reveal how the CLIL is implemented in an international and Kazakhstani context by analyzing studies on the effectiveness of CLIL application with the help of teachers' and students' perceptions. There has been much research and discussion on the perspective and effectiveness of using CLIL within a trilingual policy. Most of the research in the context of Kazakhstan has focused on the perspective of the program and the opinion of teachers. More research based on students' opinions is needed to

better understand the long-term impact and perspectives of CLIL.

METHODOLOGY

In the Kazakhstani context, there is a paucity of studies investigating students' experience with the Content and Language Integrated Learning approach. The objective of this study is to investigate the perceptions of the NIS schools' graduates on the CLIL implementation. The study is based on a qualitative phenomenology research design to answer the following research questions and sub-questions:

How do graduates of NIS schools describe their experiences of studying subjects with the implementation of the CLIL approach?

- What sort of challenges did the graduates of NIS encounter in the CLIL lessons?
- How does their experience with the CLIL help them after graduation?

RESEARCH DESIGN

Aiming to answer the research questions and to explore NIS graduates' experience with the implementation of CLIL, a qualitative approach will be employed. According to Creswell (2011), a central phenomenon is developed and examined in qualitative research. Considering CLIL as the central phenomenon, the qualitative method allows obtaining a deep understanding of various CLIL aspects through personal experiences.

As for the type of research design, the given inquiry will employ a phenomenological research method. A phenomenological research design identifies the common meaning and essence of a lived experience from the perception of individuals (Creswell, 2012). Hence, a phenomenological research design will be conducted to investigate a shared experience among NIS school graduates who studied with the

implementation of CLIL.

RESEARCH SAMPLE

The participants for the study were selected based on a purposive sampling strategy. Patten and Newhart (2018) state that by using purposive sampling, researchers deliberately select individuals that provide relevant information. Notwithstanding the fact that the generalizability of the sample that was selected purposefully is limited, participants can provide useful information about their experiences to deeply understand the phenomenon using this sampling approach. Moreover, considering the common characteristics of the graduates of NIS schools, a homogeneous sampling type will be applied.

The graduates of NIS schools from Northern Kazakhstan will be recruited as the research participants. The researcher decided to analyze their background since the graduates who studied with the CLIL approach can share their perceptions and experience regarding the long-term effect of CLIL. The choice to interview the graduates of NIS schools from the Northern regions is justified because in each Nazarbayev Intellectual School of Physics and Mathematics and School of Chemistry and Biology students choose two preferable profession-oriented subjects and learn other similar subjects using the CLIL method. These subjects are Physics, Biology, Chemistry, ICT, Global Perspectives, and Economics. Therefore, the research site will be focused on schools in Northern Kazakhstan.

Through purposive homogeneous sampling, five NIS graduates of the class of 2021 will be selected. The target participants studied CLIL lessons in Nazarbayev Intellectual schools in Northern Kazakhstan and they are students of different universities at the moment. The rationale behind choosing NIS graduates of the class of 2021 is that they clearly remember their experience with CLIL lessons and can identify its

further influence. Since all the graduates are of legal age, the researcher will take oral consent from each participant to have permission to conduct the study.

DATA COLLECTION

Semi-structured interviews with the NIS graduates were conducted to collect the data for the study. According to Merriam and Tisdell (2016), interviews allow one to gain information about past events and how individuals interpret the surrounding world. Furthermore, the use of a semi-structured type of interview allowed the researcher to order and ask questions flexibly.

Two NIS graduates of the class of 2021 chose to be interviewed face-to-face and the other two participants were interviewed online through a telephone call. Telephone interviews eased the process of data collection because the participants are geographically dispersed. Since direct observation was not possible in this study, interviewing the participants through open-ended questions provided relevant information. Before the interview, all participants were informed of the details and purpose of the study. The researcher also notified them of ethical aspects and guaranteed anonymity. All interviewees provided necessary information since they did not change the subject and answered all questions. In addition to the predefined list of questions, the researcher also asked follow-up questions to get more information on the experiences of the participants.

DATA MANAGEMENT

All the collected data is stored in the researcher's USB flash drive. The security of the data is managed by storing the files in the folder with the password and regular monitoring. Interview recordings will be deleted after conducting the study and only the interview transcripts with the analysis will be stored. Transcripts of the interviews do not include the real names of the participants.

DATA ANALYSIS

During the initial stage, the interview recordings were transcribed with the help of the function in Word Online that converted the audio files into text format. As soon as the texts were edited and prepared, the interview transcripts were analyzed by intensive reading and identifying valuable information. Through open coding, sentences with certain characteristics were highlighted. Then the process of axial coding organized and combined the initial codes. Axial codes were reviewed and the codes having connections were organized based on one core category. Two major themes Challenges and Benefits containing sub-themes were identified. Sub-themes having no connection to answering the research questions were excluded. One unbiased person provided feedback on the report.

LIMITATIONS

The research findings cannot be generalized to the whole population covering all the NIS school students and graduates since the research sample is limited to NIS schools in Northern Kazakhstan. In addition, it will be difficult to interview a larger sample size because interviewing is time-consuming. Due to lack of time, few participants were reached. More participants would have provided more information on the subject matter from various perspectives. Furthermore, since interview analysis takes a long time, a quantitative method could be applied to reach a large number of participants.

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

According to Merriam and Tisdell (2016), the trustworthiness of the study is dependent on the researcher's ethics. To follow ethical considerations and have permission for the exploration, the investigator asked for verbal consent from the participants. Moreover, the researcher paid prior attention during the interview to the

interaction with no harm. All the participants were informed in advance and during the interview that involvement in the research is voluntary. Participants were informed about their rights to skip uncomfortable questions or stop the interview at any moment. To provide anonymity and minimize the risks, each participant will have pseudonyms in interview protocols and transcripts. It will be challenging to identify from which NIS schools graduated the participants since the cities of Northern Kazakhstan were not named.

REFLECTION

As a researcher, I am interested in obtaining reliable data because I studied at NIS school. However, after the 10th grade, I transferred to another school. Since I am not a graduate of NIS school, the experience of studying subjects with the implementation of CLIL is unfamiliar. Thus, the risks of getting inaccurate and falsified data will be minimized

FINDINGS

Investigating the experience of NIS graduates in studying school subjects with the CLIL approach provided a plethora of information for this study. The analysis of the interviews revealed four major categories: challenges, benefits, communication, and long-term influence.

CHALLENGES

Although interviewees in most cases positively viewed CLIL implementation, they mentioned that linguistic and academic challenges in different aspects of education occurred.

Language difficulties. The study identified that participants encountered a language barrier when they started learning subjects in English during the initial stage. The language barrier was characterized by comprehension difficulties of the topic of the lesson and the task format, memorizing

and using terminology, and the need for translation. As NIS Graduate 1 explains: “There was a language barrier because you do not know the language 100%, that is, you had to translate. Also, when explaining the subject, too”.

In the interview, two participants stated that it was complicated to learn terminology and subject-specific vocabulary to some degree. Graduate 1 reports: “Many words and terms were incomprehensible in the texts”.

Academic challenges. Examining the experience of studying science and other subjects in English indicated that only one participant encountered a negative influence on academic performance. As reported by Graduate 1: “It became more difficult to learn with the introduction of English into our disciplines... It affected the grades and the grades were much lower than they were in the native language”.

Some interviewees pointed out that studying science itself is quite a complicated process without taking into account the language of education. Graduate 1 commented about this issue: “Chemistry was a difficult subject because there were so many formulas, and it was hard to memorize everything”. One more participant reports: “Studying subjects is difficult, but the language of instruction did not make much difference” (Graduate 3).

BENEFITS

Despite some linguistic and academic challenges, NIS graduates shared that CLIL had a positive impact on their language proficiency, content learning, and academic and personal skills.

Language proficiency improvement. When exploring the possible influence of studying with the implementation of CLIL, all four participants stated that their English language proficiency benefited while studying subjects in English. NIS graduates shared their positive experiences

mentioning that their four basic language skills developed, and vocabulary was enriched by terms, academic words, and other useful phrases. Graduate 3 reports: “In general, my English level has improved because of this experience”.

Furthermore, interviewees noted that speaking skills developed due to studying sciences with the CLIL approach influenced spoken English. Graduate 2 reports: “Science subjects, they increase general English a lot. Colloquial, supposedly”. Another participant mentioned that such an experience contributed to positive cognitive changes related to the English language. Graduate 3 states: “It helped me to think not only in my native language but also to think in other languages”. In other words, studying in English stimulated them to start thinking in the foreign language.

Content learning. All four interviews pointed out that studying content in English provided them with the opportunity to find various useful and reliable materials for education. Graduate 4 outlines: “In English, it is much easier to find various materials, books, examples, solutions, and so on. I guess it increased my knowledge of subjects...”. In addition, some participants shared that they studied sciences in-depth due to the availability of many reliable resources. As Graduate 2 comments: “More in-depth study of the subject, because there are more resources and more books in English”.

Academic and personal skills. When investigating how CLIL affects the NIS graduates except for language and content knowledge, participants reported that their academic and personal skills such as writing, data analysis, and effective communication respectively evolved. The first participant mentioned that speaking, effective presentation skills, leadership, and competitiveness were developed. Graduate 2 states: “I personally learned how to compress a lot of information and to identify key points from a very large text”. Similarly, another participant outlines:

“Paraphrasing, citation styles, which are very important in writing any project work. Basically, the structure of design and use” (Graduate 4).

In addition to the development of personal and academic skills, Graduate 3 points out: “Skills of speaking, understanding, communicating, reading and listening in English. I began to think in the language in which I was learning. It affected the structure of a person’s thinking”.

LONG-TERM INFLUENCE

Examining how graduates’ experience with the CLIL helps them in the long-term perspective, showed that it provides an opportunity to live and study abroad, to use the acquired knowledge in university and communication. Graduate 1 explains: “ It made life easier for me at university. Some words, vocabulary, I use in everyday life until now.”. Graduate 2 states: “Education in an English group in university. Perhaps, in the future it will help with internships on behalf of the university, in exchange programs.”.

However, while some interviewees stated that experience with the CLIL does not help in life, some of them reported that it improved English and helps in communication with foreigners. Graduate 3 outlines:

It improved my English, and it helps me to communicate with foreign students, and with my friends from other countries because English is a world language and I can talk to them about any topic. Even about physics, biology, and any subject we studied in school.

DISCUSSION

This chapter aims to discuss findings to explore the experiences of NIS graduates with the CLIL lessons and answer the research questions.

LINGUISTIC AND ACADEMIC CHALLENGES

The results of this study revealed that NIS graduates encountered various difficulties related to the English language and subject learning at the beginning of CLIL implementation. The tendency of having linguistic obstacles such as difficulties in comprehension of subject-specific vocabulary is compliant with the numerous studies all over the world (Finardi et al., 2016; Huerta-Abril & Shashken, 2020; Syzdykbayeva, 2017). Notwithstanding the fact that NIS students learn four basic English skills in-depth before the transition to the CLIL lessons, it is complicated in the initial period to study subjects in English, especially sciences. Syzdykbayeva (2017) explains that students are hampered in mastering the language since there is a lack of English speaking environment. As a result, students may have a language barrier, and difficulties understanding the content, learning scientific processes, and participating in class. The finding revealed that there is a need for teachers’ support and the use of scaffolds at the start of the CLIL application.

BENEFITS AND LONG-TERM EFFECTS

The majority of the participants reported that studying subjects in English had a positive effect on their English language proficiency, especially vocabulary and speaking. These findings are in line with the previously conducted studies on CLIL (Pladevall-Ballester, 2018; Fielding & Harbon, 2020; Huertas-Abril & Shashken, 2021; Zanoni, 2021) that indicated that CLIL is a beneficial method for language improvement.

Furthermore, NIS graduates stated that CLIL provided them with the opportunity to study sciences and other subjects thoroughly since there is an abundance of educational materials and resources in English. Although in the previous research exploring the teachers’ perception of CLIL, teachers reported a deficiency of resources and books (Bekenova, 2016; Huertas-Abril & Shashken, 2021; Karimsakova et al.,

2018), students did not encounter such challenges. This could be explained by the fact that while teachers need careful preparation and materials to construct a lesson plan, students can use numerous reliable sources for completing the tasks and further education.

Another important finding was that NIS graduates shared their experiences of developing distinct academic and personal skills. Hanesová (2014) found out that CLIL implementation has the potential to develop critical, creative thinking, and communication skills in students. As interviews indicated, the participants enhanced their effective communication and cognitive abilities, writing skills, and other personal skills.

Moreover, some participants claimed that CLIL is beneficial in university and for their future. These results support the previous studies which revealed the students' positive view of CLIL on their future (Coyle, 2013; Syzdykbayeva, 2017). This finding revealed that CLIL has a positive impact on students' further education in university, communication with foreigners and provides an opportunity to study and live abroad.

CONCLUSION

This chapter indicated the experience of NIS graduates regarding the CLIL method covering the possible challenges, benefits, and the influence of the approach in the long-term perspective. CLIL students may have distinct individual experiences that require further in-depth investigation with the broader sample size.

CONCLUSION

This chapter focuses on providing a summary of the study. The purpose of the present research was to determine the perceptions and experiences of NIS graduates with the CLIL approach. The current research also aimed to examine the long-term influence of the experience of

MAJOR CONCLUSIONS

Considering the first research question, the findings revealed that participants in most cases have positive attitudes to CLIL and describe their experiences favorably. NIS graduates expressed their positive experiences by mentioning their improved language proficiency and content knowledge, as well as developing useful academic and personal skills. Despite the positive aspects of CLIL, some participants reported that they encountered difficulties related to the educational demands and education using the English language. The study found that at the initial stage of the CLIL implementation, students encounter challenges because they are used to learning in their mother tongue, considering their relatively high level of English language. However, after a period of adaptation, students get used to learning in English, after which they develop a more positive attitude to the method.

In the response to the second research question, some participants mentioned that they experienced language and academic difficulties such as challenging understanding of the content, and language barrier at the very beginning. Nonetheless, some graduates reported that studying sciences itself is complicated and they did not notice any difference due to the change in the language of instruction. The conclusion that can be drawn from these findings is that each CLIL student overcomes different challenges, which depend on individual peculiarities such as English language level, knowledge of a particular subject, and ability to learn and adapt to changes.

Another major finding is that through CLIL, students gained access to numerous English-language resources that provide reliable information and enhance their knowledge of particular subjects. Moreover, NIS graduates mentioned that CLIL provides new opportunities related to education in universities all over the globe and their improved language proficiency

allows them to have active communication with foreigners. Interestingly, during the education with the CLIL application, some graduates developed useful skills. Hence, NIS graduates noted the distinct impact of the CLIL method.

Overall, these findings drew a picture of the level of CLIL implementation in NIS schools in Kazakhstan and to what extent NIS students were satisfied with the CLIL approach. The NIS graduates have a positive perception of this method of teaching, noting both minor difficulties and favorable impacts of CLIL.

LIMITATIONS

In addition to the previously discussed methodological limitations, it is important to consider other limitations of this research in future studies. First, few participants were reached and interviewed due to a time constraint for conducting the study. To gather more information and generalize the results to the entire target population, more interviews should be conducted with students and alumni of all Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools.

In addition, all interviewees preferred to answer in Russian. Therefore, some concepts and ideas of participants may not have been fully transferred because of translating the interviews into English.

DIRECTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

The findings of the research proposal that CLIL can be studied from distinct perspectives. A future study covering a broader sample size with an extended number of research sites would probably provide more generalizable results. Since the present research is focused on the experience of graduate students of NIS, it is suggested to reproduce the study for the graduates of other schools such as Bilim Innovation Lyceums, that are implementing the CLIL approach. In terms of sample

size, it would be interesting to conduct quantitative research that will cover all Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools and other piloting schools. Moreover, the study comparing and contrasting the experiences and perceptions of teachers and students would be interesting.

IMPLICATIONS

The research findings may provide useful information for school administration and the Ministry of Education and Science. The information provided by participants on the difficulties of learning with CLIL can be used to improve the program not only in piloting schools but also during the introduction of the method in regular schools. To improve the effectiveness of CLIL, school administrations should introduce preparatory activities for students by foreign language teachers, subject teachers, and psychologists. Such arrangements minimizing possible challenges for the students may contribute to a better understanding of the school disciplines, effective communication in English, and increased psychological readiness. Moreover, the policymakers may review the rules and measures for the introduction of the CLIL approach in general education schools.

REFERENCES

- Bekenova, A. (2016). Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) as a response to the trilingual education implementation: Teachers' perceptions, practices, and challenges. GSE Nazarbayev University. https://conferences.nis.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/1-Bekenova%D0%90_eng.pdf
- Council of the European Union. (1995). Council resolution of 31 March 1995 on improving and diversifying language learning and teaching within the education systems of the European Union. *Official Journal of the European Union*, C 207, 1-5.
- Coyle, D., Hood, P. & Marsh, D. (2010). *CLIL: Content and language integrated learning*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Coyle, D. (2013). Listening to learners: An investigation into 'successful learning' across CLIL contexts. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 16, 244-266. doi:10.1080/13670050.2013.777384
- Eurydice. (2006). *Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) at school in Europe*. Publications Office. <https://op.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/756ebdaa-f694-44e4-8409-21eef02c9b9b>
- Fielding, R., & Harbon, L. (2020). Dispelling the monolingual myth: exploring literacy outcomes in Australian bilingual programmes. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 25(3), 997-1020. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2020.1734531>
- Goris, J., Denessen, E., & Verhoeven, L. (2019). Effects of content and language integrated learning in Europe A systematic review of longitudinal experimental studies. *European Educational Research Journal*, 18(6), 675-698. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1474904119872426>
- Hanesová, D. (2014). Development of critical and creative thinking skills in CLIL. *Journal of language and cultural education*, 2(2), 33-51.
- Huertas-Abril, C. A., & Shashken, A. (2021). Exploring the potential of CLIL in Kazakhstan: A qualitative study. *Revista Complutense de Educación*, 32(2), 261-271. <https://doi.org/10.5209/rced.68345>
- Kakenov, R. (2017). Teachers' experiences of using CLIL in Kazakh language classrooms. *NUGSE Research in Education*, 2(2), 21-29.
- Karabassova, L. (2020). Is top-down CLIL justified? A grounded theory exploration of secondary school Science teachers' experiences. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 25(4), 1530-1545. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2020.1775781>
- Karimsakova, A. S., Yermenova, K. K., & Kuzembayeva, G. A. (2018). CLIL implementation in West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov State Medical University: Challenges and experience. *Journal of Medicine of West Kazakhstan*, 57(1).
- Nazarbayev, N. (2012). The message of the president of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. Nazarbayev to the people of Kazakhstan. *Strategy - 2050: the new political course of the established state*, Astana. Retrieved from <https://strategy2050.kz/ru>

Moldagazinova (2019). Trilingual education in Kazakhstan: What to expect. <https://central-asiaprogram.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Moldazaginova-CAP-Paper-May-2019.pdf>

Pladevall-Ballester, E. (2018). A longitudinal study of primary school EFL learning motivation in CLIL and non-CLIL settings. *Language Teaching Research*, 23(6), 765–786. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168818765877>

San Isidro, X. (2018). Innovations and challenges in CLIL implementation in Europe. *Theory Into Practice*, 57(3), 185–195. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00405841.2018.1484038>

Syzdykbaeva, R. (2017). Students' attitudes and perceptions of Content and Language Integrated Learning in a secondary school. *Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education*.

Zanoni, F. (2021). Students' view on CLIL: Perceived benefits and limitations. *Educazione Linguistica. Language Education*, 10(2). <https://doi.org/10.30687/elle/2280-6792/2021/02/005>

Zhilbayev, O. Z., Syrymbetova L. S., Mukasheva, M.Y., Zhetpisbayeva B. Z., & Smagulova G. T. (2019). Promotion of trilingual education in Kazakhstan schools: Online monitoring results. *Journal of Siberian Federal University. Humanities & Social Sciences*, 12 (2), 285-301.